

How to Cite:

Hernani, H., Munaf, Y., Rahman, K., Yogya, M. A., & Prihatin, P. S. (2022). Implementation of policy for collecting parking retributions in an urban forest in Rokan Hilir regency Indonesia. *International Journal of Health Sciences*, 6(S6), 4494–4506.
<https://doi.org/10.53730/ijhs.v6nS6.11616>

Implementation of policy for collecting parking retributions in an urban forest in Rokan Hilir regency Indonesia

Hernani

Postgraduate Program Universitas Islam Riau, Pekanbaru, Indonesia

*Corresponding author email: hernani_pps@student.uir.ac.id

Yusri Munaf

Postgraduate Program Universitas Islam Riau, Pekanbaru, Indonesia

Khairul Rahman

Postgraduate Program Universitas Islam Riau, Pekanbaru, Indonesia

Moris Adidi Yogya

Postgraduate Program Universitas Islam Riau, Pekanbaru, Indonesia

Panca Setyo Prihatin

Postgraduate Program Universitas Islam Riau, Pekanbaru, Indonesia

Abstract---The main focus of this research is implementing the levy collection policy in the Urban Forest, Bangko District, Rokan Hilir Regency. The substance of the problem is identified as follows: (1) How is the Implementation of the Parking Retribution Collection Policy in the Urban Forest, Bangko District, Rokan Hilir Regency? ; (2) What are the factors that influence the implementation of parking levies in the City Forest in increasing the local revenue of Rokan Hilir Regency?. The theory used as an approach to this research problem is the theory of policy implementation (Edward III,) which consists of the dimensions of communication, resources, disposition, and bureaucratic structure. The research method used in this study is qualitative, with data collection techniques through participant observation, in-depth interviews, and data triangulation. The results showed that the implementation of the City Forest parking levy collection policy carried out by the Rokan Hilir Regency Transportation Service had not run optimally. This was caused by several factors ranging from weak supervision and lack of commitment to the lack of availability of resources owned by the government so the implementation of parking fees was not run optimally.

Keywords---policy implementation, collecting parking, urban forest.

Introduction

Public policy implementation is the stage of implementing the policy itself, all forms of activity are in this stage. Therefore, policy implementation is an essential part of the public policy process. In another view, Daniel Mazmanian and Paul Sabatier in Agustino (2014:139) define policy implementation as following fundamental policy decisions, usually in the form of laws, but can also take orders. or influential executive or judicial decisions. Implementation is the most challenging stage in a policy, as stated by Riant Nugroho (2008:436) that policy implementation is the hardest thing, because here problems that are sometimes not found in the concept, appear in the field. :530) asserts that the actual implementation of policy is not only concerned with the mechanism of elaborating political decisions into routine procedures through bureaucratic channels, but also with issues of conflict, decisions and who gets what from a policy.

The explanation above implies that implementation is the implementation of essential decisions, usually in the form of laws, but can also take the form of critical executive orders or decisions or decisions of the judiciary. Ideally, the decision identifies the problem to be addressed, sets the goals to be achieved, and "structures" the implementation process in various ways. The process goes through a number of stages starting with the ratification of the constitution, followed by the policy outputs (decision) from the implementing agency, the target group's compliance with the decision, the actual impact, both intentional and unintended, of the output, perceptions of the impact of the agency's decision, and finally, essential revisions (or attempted revisions) in the constitution.

The Rokan Hilir Regency government issued Regional Regulation No. 19 of 2011 concerning Retribution for Special Parking Places as the foundation for collecting parking fees in various locations, including the City Forest of Bangko District, Rokan Hilir Regency. This was done to maximize regional income. Currently, both residents of Bagansiapiapai City and visitors from outside the city frequently travel by vehicle to the Urban Forest. 400 000 to 1 million dollars are generated for the government each day from parking in the City Forest; during public holidays like holidays, long holidays, and so on, this amount keeps rising. This demonstrates that one of the key areas that the government must improve to increase local revenue environmental sustainability is the Urban Forest.

The Rokan Hilir Regency government issued Regional Regulation No. 19 of 2011 concerning Retribution for Special Parking Places as the foundation for collecting parking fees in various locations, including the City Forest of Bangko District, Rokan Hilir Regency. This was done to maximize regional income. Currently, both residents of Bagansiapiapai City and visitors from outside the city frequently travel by vehicle to the Urban Forest. 400 000 to 1 million dollars are generated for the government each day from parking in the City Forest; during public holidays like holidays, long holidays, and so on, this amount keeps rising. This demonstrates that one of the key areas that the government must improve to increase environmental sustainability is the Urban Forest. This condition can certainly give

a negative image to the City Forest and the Rokan Hilir Regency Government itself because they are considered to have failed to manage regional assets properly.

It should be noted that this problem is not the only problem that occurs in the City Forest, because several other problems greatly affect the sustainability of the City Forest itself, such as the finding of indications of illegal extortion in the City Forest. Indications of this extortion can be seen from the availability of cash boxes provided by City Forest guards for people who want to give money voluntarily. Urban Forest is one of the public facilities provided by the government for free, this means that people who want to come to the City Forest are not charged a penny. Even so, the government can still apply an entry fee policy for visitors, but the government must have clear regulations both operationally and legally. However, if this is not fulfilled, methods such as what is happening in the City Forest today can lead to indications of extortion.

The Rokan Hilir Regency government issued Regional Regulation No. 19 of 2011 concerning Retribution for Special Parking Places as the foundation for collecting parking fees in various locations, including the City Forest of Bangko District, Rokan Hilir Regency. This was done to maximize regional income. Currently, both residents of Bagansiapiapai City and visitors from outside the city frequently travel by vehicle to the Urban Forest. 400 000 to 1 million dollars are generated for the government each day from parking in the City Forest; during public holidays like holidays, long holidays, and so on, this amount keeps rising. This demonstrates that one of the key areas that the government must improve to increase environmental sustainability is the Urban Forest. Therefore, by subjecting a levy to the provision of services and permits by the regional government, the imposition of this levy is a direct achievement of the acquisition or enjoyment of services or the granting of permits received by a person or entity.

According to Dwi Anggoro (2017: 19), parking fees are one of the sources developed by the region in increasing Regional Original Income imposed on people who directly enjoy the facilities provided by the government. One of the retributions that have an influence on Regional Original Income is parking fees, which are those owned and managed by the Regional Government Parking levies as a source of Regional Original Income originating from the community, where the Regional Revenue Service carries out management. Therefore, parking levies are one of the payments Parking retribution collection is the entire activity to withdraw or collect parking fees by those outlined in the context of efforts to obtain remuneration income from facilities or facilities provided by the Rokan Hilir Regency government. The Rokan Hilir Regency Government provides the agency that obtains parking services in the parking lot.

According to the Decree of the Minister of Home Affairs No. 73 of 1999 concerning Guidelines for the Implementation of Regional Parking, what is meant by parking is the immobile state of a vehicle that is not temporary. While the parking lot is a place to stop vehicles at certain locations either on the edge of public roads, buildings, courtyards, or public buildings. Meanwhile, based on the Decree of the Director General of Land Transportation No. 272/HK.105/DRJD/96 concerning Technical Guidelines for the Implementation of Parking Facilities, what is meant by the operation of parking facilities is a planning method in organizing vehicle

parking facilities both on the road and off the road. Additionally, teenage crime is a concern that frequently affects the Urban Forest region. In the Urban Forest, only teens are the intended victims of crimes, which almost always happen at night. Additionally, a robbery committed by a bunch of criminals in the vicinity of the City Forest made the area around the forest less secure for tourists at night. The amount of guests that desire to visit the City Forest is undoubtedly impacted by this situation, as is the revenue from automobile parking fines.

Currently, the collection of parking fees in the City Forest has also violated the Regional Regulation of Rokan Hilir Regency No. 19 of 2011 concerning Retribution for Special Parking Places, article 13 concerning the procedures for collection, it is explained that (1) Levy collection cannot be wholesaled. (2) Charges are collected using the application's other equivalent document. (3) Other equivalent documents as referred to in paragraph (2) above, in the form of tickets, coupons and subscription cards provided by the Regional Revenue Service. (4) The results of the levy as referred to in this Article shall be deposited into the Regional Treasury. This provision is also confirmed in the Decree (SK) of the Head of the Rokan Hilir Regency Transportation Service Number: /DISHUB - D/2020/ Regarding Parking Location Points and Parking Officers for the Batu 6 Bagansiapiapi Coastal Rokan Hilir Regency 2020, namely the collection of vehicle parking levies must complete parking attendant attributes in the form of parking tickets, parking vests and parking attendant membership cards. Therefore, phenomena like this are certainly an indication of the unpreparedness of the Rokan Hilir Regency government in managing its regional assets. Based on the background of the problems described above, the researchers became increasingly interested in conducting a special and in-depth study on the management of motorized vehicle parking fees in Rokan Hilir Regency. Therefore, the researcher proposes a title of study as the limit of the study in the discussion. The title of this research is the Implementation of Parking Retribution Collection Policy in the Urban Forest, Bangko District, Rokan Hilir Regency.

Research Method

Descriptive research using a qualitative methodology is the research type used. This approach explains situations that happen precisely and are detailed. Additionally, a qualitative approach offers a thorough type of data in examining a phenomenon when examined from the issues addressed. The research process's most strategic step is the data collection process. Sugiono (2011: 19) asserts that there are several situations, resources, and methods for gathering data. Primary and secondary sources may be used in data collection depending on the data sources. In the meanwhile, there are several methods for gathering data, including interviews, observation, and recordkeeping. This study was carried out in the Indonesian province of Riau's Rokan Hilir Regency. The methods of interviewing, documenting, and observing were employed to obtain data for this study. Utilizing data reduction, data presentation, and conclusion drawing, the analysis design and data validity were carried out (Miles, 1992).

Result and Discussion

The City Forest of Bangko District, Rokan Hilir Regency is one of the tourist destination locations that many people in Rokan Hilir Regency currently visit, so that the existence of the City Forest is not only used as a complement to public service facilities but as an essential asset in increasing regional income. One sector that provides income for the region is through visitor vehicle parking fees. Through this sector, the government of Rokan Hilir Regency explores and utilizes it as a source of regional income as said by Plt. The Head of the Rokan Hilir Regency Transportation Service, SUSILO WIDADO ALY, S. Sos, M.Si, who explained that: "The government of Rokan Hilir Regency has begun to optimize every asset owned by the region, including the collection of parking fees in the forest. Currently, we are targeting parking retribution revenue at the City Forest location of 400 thousand to 1 million rupiah" (interview, 26 June 2022).

This justification underlines that even if the value obtained from parking fees is not as high as that from other sectors, this is inextricably linked to the various issues the Rokan Hilir Regency government is now dealing with. It falls under the purview of the Rokan Hilir Regency's administration, particularly the Department of Transportation, which is in charge of overseeing parking in the City Forest. Some of these issues include poorly maintained parking lots, extortion warning signs, and rampant thuggery in and around the urban forest. These elements play a role in whether government regulations intended to maximize parking limitations in City Forests are successfully implemented or not. Related to this, the researcher will thoroughly review the variables that are closely related to the implementation of the parking retribution policy for the City Forest, Bangko District, and Rokan Hilir Regency, among others, as follows:

Communication

According to Agustino (2014: 131), communication is one of the important variables that influence the implementation of public policy, communication will determine the success of achieving the goals of implementing public policy. Effective implementation will take place, if decision-makers know what they are going to do. Therefore, information known to decision makers can only be obtained through good communication. In addition, communication is very important because the higher the knowledge and understanding of the policy, the lower the level of rejection and error in applying the policy in the real world. According to Edward III, there are three important things in this communication dimension, namely (1) transmission, namely the way information is conveyed to the public, (2) clarity of information conveyed, and (3) consistent delivery of the information.

Effective policy implementation starts with transmission, which means that those implementing the policy must be aware of what has to be done. Before being carried out, policy directives and instructions must be communicated to or forwarded to implementers. An official must therefore be aware that a decision has been reached and that an order for its execution has been issued before he can put a policy into action. The likelihood that decisions and execution orders

will be carried out increases with the accuracy with which they are communicated to or forwarded to those who must carry them out.

As described above, in this study, the transmission aspect in the communication of parking retribution policy implementation in the City Forest is seen from how the Rokan Hilir Regency Transportation Service can communicate the parking retribution collection policy in the City Forest as the agency responsible for implementing the policy. In this case, the Department of Transportation must ensure that all parties know the parking retribution policy carried out in the City Forest, both from the government (districts, urban villages, Bamenda and other relevant agencies) as well as from the community itself which is the target group of the policy.

The transmission of government policy communication in the application of parking fees in the City Forest may now be said to be operating fairly well, according to the findings of the researcher's investigation. As Mr. SURYADI, the Parking Section and Terminal Staff of the Rokan Hilir Regency Transportation Service, explained: "Before implementing the parking fee policy in the City Forest, we from the Transportation Agency had communicated with several agencies regarding the issue of parking fees in the City Forest," this can be seen from the knowledge of each agency related to the policy. 23 June 2022 (interview). Mr. SUSILO WIDADO ALY also confirmed this explanation, S. Sos, M.Si who said that: "The Department of Transportation has communicated with several OPDs such as Bamenda and the Department of the Environment regarding the issue of parking fees in the City Forest" (interview 23 June 2022)

The existence of communication transmission from the Department of Transportation in the implementation of parking fees is a concrete step for the government in maximizing the implementation of the City Forest parking retribution policy. However, it should be noted that the implementation of communication transmission carried out by the Department of Transportation should not stop there because the most important aspect of a policy is the target of the policy itself. Related to this, the target of the policy who also has the right to know about the parking levy is the visitors themselves.

Based on the analysis's findings, the researchers demonstrated that, despite the fact that the community (visitors) is the government's (Transportation Service's) primary target when implementing policies, the community has never been involved in any policymaking to date, including the implementation of vehicle parking fees in the City Forest. Additionally, Mr. SURYADI reaffirmed this, saying: "It is true that we have not informed the community about the introduction of the parking punishment policy, but we have confirmed that this policy would not hurt the community." 23 June 2022 (interview).

Mr. SUSILO WIDADO ALY also said a similar explanation, S. Sos, M.Si who explained that: "Currently we are still unable to invite the public in any of these policies because there are several reasons that I cannot convey, but we as the government will ensure that the policies we make will not harm the people of Rokan Hilir Regency" (interview 23 June 2022). Based on this explanation, it can be understood that it is true that so far the government has been less willing to

invite the public to be actively involved in discussions related to vehicle parking retribution policies in City Forests. Therefore, many people, especially the Bagansiapiapi community, do not know the retribution policy as explained by Bang Edi who is one of the Bagansiapiapi people who said that: "Honestly, I don't know whether there is a parking levy in the City Forest, (interview 22 June 2022). Eni, who is also a member of the Bagansiapiapi community, also explained that: "As far as I remember the government has never provided information on parking retributions to the public, either in oral or in written form" (interview 23 June 2022)

As explained earlier that two important aspects will always influence the success of a policy, the first is the implementer of the policy and the second is the target of the policy. Related to this, the Rokan Hilir Regency Transportation Office should have realized that the communication transmission they had done so far did not only focus on related agencies but also ensured that the target of the policy received the same information so that the communication transmission carried out was truly maximal. The second aspect highlighted by Edward III in the context of policy communication is the clarity of communication. It is said that if a policy can be implemented as desired, then the implementation instructions must not only be accepted by policy implementers but also clear communication. Regarding this matter, based on the results of the researcher's analysis, it shows that the clarity of communication about the implementation of parking fees in the City Forest carried out by the Department of Transportation has been carried out very well, as said by Mr. SUSILO WIDADO ALY, S. Sos, M.Si, namely: "We have clearly conveyed all the provisions in the implementation of the parking levy to all relevant OPDs and to the parking attendants in the field" (interview 23 June 2022)

Pak Ijul also justifies this explanation as the City Forest parking attendant who said that: "Before this City Forest was officially opened, the Department of Transportation provided knowledge about the procedures for withdrawing parking fees, from procedures to vehicle parking fees" (interview 23 June 2022) The third aspect which according to Edward III is also important in the effective communication of a public policy is consistency. Edward III in Winarno (2016) said that if policy implementation is to be effective, then the implementation orders must be consistent. Although the orders conveyed to policy implementers have an element of clarity, if the orders are contradictory, then the orders will not make it easier for policy implementers to carry out their duties properly.

This will lead to poor policy implementation because extremely loose measures are likely to be utilized inappropriately to fulfill policy objectives. Inconsistent policy implementation will encourage implementers to take very loose measures in interpreting and executing policies. In connection with this, based on the findings of the researcher's analysis, it is demonstrated that the officers of the Department of Forestry of Rokan Hilir Regency consistently provide information or explanations about the government's policy for collecting parking fees for City Forests in accordance with what has been determined or contained in the policy, both in terms of administrative requirements. Regarding the implementation of guest vehicle parking, including the implementation of service procedures, service administration costs, service completion times, and other issues.

Based on this explanation, it can be concluded that the communication in the implementation of the policy on the withdrawal of parking fees in the City Forest carried out by the Transportation Service of Rokan Hilir Regency has been carried out effectively and adequately, this can be seen from the transmission aspect (how policy information is conveyed to related parties), the clarity of policy information submitted, and aspects of consistency in informing policies although there are still aspects that the Department of Transportation must improve as the agency responsible for implementing the policy.

Resources

Resources are one of the factors that influence the success of an implementation, although the contents of the policy have been communicated clearly and consistently, if the implementer lacks the resources to implement the policy, it will not run effectively. Resources supporting policy implementation can be tangible, such as human resources, budgetary resources, equipment resources, information resources, and authority. Therefore, human resources are one of the variables that affect the success and failure of implementation. Implementation is very dependent on human resources (apparatus), thus human resources in implementing policies and having the expertise and ability to carry out tasks, recommendations, and orders from superiors (leaders). Therefore, human resources must have accuracy and appropriateness between the number of staff needed and the expertise possessed by the work tasks they are handling.

Budget resources are resources that affect implementation after the existence of human resources, the limited available budget causes the quality of services to the public that must be provided to the community is also limited. The limited budget causes the disposition of the actors to be low and there will even be transfers made by the actors towards achieving the goals and targets that have been set. Equipment resources are resources that influence the success and failure of implementation, according to Edward III, namely Equipment resources are the means used to operationalize the implementation of a policy which includes buildings, land, and facilities, all of which will facilitate providing services in policy implementation. However, the limited equipment facilities needed in implementing the policy have caused the failure of policy implementation, because with limited facilities, it is difficult to obtain accurate, precise, fast, and reliable information which will significantly harm the implementation of accountability.

Information resources and authority are also important factors in implementation, relevant and sufficient information regarding how to implement a policy. Information about the willingness or ability of various parties involved in implementing the policy is intended so that the implementers will not make a mistake in interpreting how to implement it. Authority is also another resource that affects the effectiveness of policy implementation. According to Edward III, the authority (authority) that is sufficient to make its own decisions owned by an institution will influence the institution in implementing a policy. These various resources will become benchmarks in assessing the effectiveness and quality of policies produced by the government. Related to this, based on the results of the researcher's analysis of the implementation of the policy for collecting Pakir

retribution for the Bagansiapiwai City Forest seen from the various readiness and availability of resources owned by the Rokan Hilir Regency government in implementing the policy, it can be said that it is still not optimal as explained by Mr. SUSILO WIDADO ALY, S. Sos, M.Si as Pt. The Head of the Rokan Hilir Regency Transportation Service said that: "Currently, the availability of resources owned by the government in implementing the parking retribution policy in the City Forest is still very lacking, especially in the availability of human resources both in technical (field) and non-technical (administrative) forms (interview 23 June 2022)

The lack of availability of resources owned by the government in the process of implementing the policy of collecting parking fees has an impact on the quality of parking services provided by officers in the field where the collection of parking fees does not meet predetermined procedures such as not using parking tickets, parking attributes and entrance fees (infaq).) provided by the guardians of the City Forest that never existed. This condition is an indication of a shortage of human resources which has a negative impact as stated by one of the visitors, Mr. Manjupi, who explained that: "The lack of resources owned by the government is very clear from the quality of parking services they provide, ranging from parking spaces that are still narrow (less spacious) to irregular vehicle parking arrangements" (interview 23 June 2022). The lack of resources owned by the government at this time is seen not only from its human resources but also from various other resources such as budget resources that are still lacking, equipment resources to information resources. The lack of availability of these data resources can be seen in various aspects ranging from parking equipment and the wage system to the availability of information. Things like this make implementing vehicle parking collection policies in the City Forest less than optimal.

Disposition

Disposition is a character or characteristic possessed by policy implementers. Dispositions are like commitment, honesty, and democratic nature. If the policy implementer has good characteristics or character, then he will carry out the policy well following the goals and desires of policymakers. Therefore, these variables can be used as indicators in assessing the success of a public policy. Related to this, based on the results of the analysis, the researcher shows that the disposition/attitude shown by the government in implementing the urban forest parking retribution policy can be said to be not good, this can be judged from the government's commitment to implementing vehicle parking rates and the government's commitment in the aspect of vehicle parking arrangements.

By Regional Regulation Number 19 of 2011 concerning Special Parking Retribution, it is explained that predetermined procedures must carry out every process of collecting vehicle parking fees both in terms of parking rates and in terms of parking services. However, the reality is that the collection of parking fees carried out by parking attendants is only done verbally without any clarity on the parking rates that must be paid by visitors so that the parking costs incurred by the community can exceed the provisions set by the government, namely for motorized vehicles with more than 4 wheels and heavy equipment. subject to a

tariff of Rp. 2,500, 4-wheeled motorized vehicle Rp. 1,500, three-wheeled motorized vehicle Rp. 1,000, and 2-wheeled motorized vehicles Rp. 1,000.

One of the visitors, Mr. Jumaris, also confirmed this explanation: "The parking fee problem is a bit funny, no matter how much we pay, they still receive it. I even paid 500 rupiah because at that time I didn't have any money, but there were also those who paid 2000 rupiah but the rest was not returned, but some visitors were also returned the rest (interview 24 June 2022). A similar explanation was also conveyed by Mr. Manjupi who said that: "If I pay here it is uncertain, sometimes it can be 1000 rupiah, sometimes 2000 rupiah, but what is clear is that the parking attendant never complains or explains to me what the real parking fee is" (interview 24 June 2022). This explanation is actually contrary to what was said by the government as said by SURYADI as the Parking Section and Terminal Staff of the Transportation Service who explained that: "The government is conducting socialization to the community regarding the rules for collecting vehicle parking, so that the City Forest parking retribution income will continue to increase" (interview, 23 June 2022)

From these two pieces of information, we can see that what was conveyed by the government regarding the socialization of parking retribution collection in the City Forest was never carried out, this was also reinforced by the observations of researchers who did not find any socialization of parking regulations. Thus, it can be concluded that the government's commitment to supervising the issue of parking fees is one of the factors that causes failure in implementing the parking retribution policy in the City Forest because without the supervision of the collection of parking fees, it will open up opportunities for actions outside the specified procedure. In addition, the government's lack of commitment can also be seen from the arrangement of vehicle parking carried out. For example, if referring to Number 19 of 2011 concerning Retribution for Special Parking Places, it has clearly been explained which locations can be used as parking places for visitors' vehicles, but in fact it was found that there were several visitor vehicles placed on the shoulder of the road and some were even on the sidewalk. used for pedestrians. This shows that the government's attitude in supporting the vehicle parking levy policy in urban forests is not followed by a strong commitment, so many violations occur in the field.

Bureaucratic Structure

The bureaucratic structure is an agency that is most often involved in overall policy implementation. The organizational structure in charge of implementing the policy has a major influence on the implementation of the policy. In the bureaucratic structure, two essential things influence it, one of which is the aspect of the bureaucratic structure that is important for every organization, namely the existence of standard operating procedures. This SOP is a guideline for policy implementers in acting or carrying out their duties. In addition to SOPs that affect the bureaucratic structure is the fragmentation that comes from outside the organization. SOP is the basic foundation of every activity, both technical and non-technical. Therefore, SOPs are always a reference for evaluating an activity.

Related to this, based on the analysis of researchers related to the implementation of the City Forest parking retribution policy carried out by the Department of Transportation at this time, it can still not be said to be good, this is because there are several SOPs that should be carried out by parking officers when carrying out tasks, such as not using parking tickets, attributes parking, indiscriminate parking and uncoordinated schedule development. This explanation is also strengthened by the field findings which show that most of the parking practices in the City Forest do not apply the SOPs that have been determined. In addition, this explanation was also emphasized by Mr. Manjupi as a visitor who said that "Since this City Forest was opened, as far as I remember and as far as I know, parking attendants have never given parking tickets, but there are some parking attendants who are sometimes seen using parking attributes and some do not use parking attributes" (interview 23 June 2022)

Based on this explanation, it can be understood that most of the implementation of the parking retribution policy in the City Forest is not carried out by the SOP that has been determined. This is also justified by the government where. They explain that some problems cannot be implemented by written rules and must use a community approach such as paying for parking under regulations. carry out a parking retribution policy in accordance with the applicable rules, this can be seen from their explanations which contradict the facts on the ground.

The occurrence of the various problems above is a reflection of the government's failure to supervise the implementation of parking retribution collection as said by Mr. SURYADI as Staff of the Parking Section and Terminal of the Transportation Service who explained that: "Supervision issues are quite complicated due to the limited human resources we have, therefore, we urge all relevant agencies to continue to supervise the collection of parking fees" (interview 23 July 2022). Based on this explanation, we can understand that currently the government is still unable to implement the retribution collection policy properly, but the steps taken by the government are currently having a relatively large impact on local revenue (PAD).

Recommendation

According to the findings of the researcher's examination of the application of the parking retribution policy in the Urban Forest, Bangko District, and Rokan Hilir Regency using the four elements of Edward III's strategy described in Agustino (2014:149), namely communication, resources, disposition, and bureaucratic structure, the policy has not been applied. Well and truly, even though the District Transportation Office's built-in communication component is operating quite well, other aspects that are determining factors for assessing the success of the policy's implementation are not fully fulfilled, leading to many issues in the field, ranging from the Transportation Service's failure to implement SOPs, limited resources, to the lack of government commitment in the area in implementing the policy.

References

- Akbar, Dhani, et al. "Community preparedness on transboundary oil spill governance in Bintan Island." *Journal of Physics: Conference Series*. Vol. 1655. No. 1. IOP Publishing, 2020.
- Anggoro, Damas Dwi. 2017. *Regional Taxes and Levies*, Edition 1, Malang: UB Press.
- Arikunto, Suharsimi. 2006. *Prosedur Penelitian dalam Suatu Pendekatan Praktek (Edisi Revisi IV)*. Jakarta : PT Renika Cipta.
- Augustino, Leo. 2014. *Fundamentals of Public Policy*. Alfabeta Publisher: Bandung.
- Darwin, Darwin. "The Effectiveness Of Implementation Of Development Plan Consultations In The Development Of Work Plan For The Regional Government Of Rokan Hilir Regency." (2022).
- Decree (SK) of the Head of the Rokan Hilir Regency Transportation Service Number: /DISHUB - D/2020/ Regarding Parking Location Points and Parking Officers for the Batu-6 Bagansiapiapi Coastal Ring Road, Rokan Hilir Regency in 2020
- Decree of the Director General of Land Transportation No. 272/HK.105/DRJD/96 concerning Technical Guidelines for the Implementation of Parking Facilities
- Helena, Syarifah Zahria, et al. "ANALYSIS OF THE PERFORMANCE OF STATE CIVIL SERVANTS IN THE FUNCTIONAL PROVISION OF SALARY IN THE DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION AND CULTURE PELALAWAN DISTRICT." *PalArch's Journal of Archaeology of Egypt/Egyptology* 18.3 (2021): 303-321.
- Islam, Irfan. 2009. *Principles of Formulation of State Policy*. Jakarta: Earth Literacy
- Law No. 34 of 2000 concerning Regional Taxes and Regional Levies.
- Mardalis. 2017. *Metode Penelitian Suatu Pendekatan Proposal*. Cet. XIV. Jakarta: Bumi Aksara
- Mardiasmo. 2011. *Taxation*. Revised 2011. Yogyakarta : Andi.
- Minister of Home Affairs Decree No. 73 of 1999 concerning Guidelines for the Implementation of Regional Parking
- Ministry of Education and Culture of the Republic of Indonesia. *Indonesian Language Dictionary*, (Jakarta: Language Development and Development Agency, 2016) Accessed March 12, 2022
- Augustino, Leo. 2016. *Dasar – Dasar Kebijakan Publik*. Bandung : Alfabeta
- Moleong, Lexy J. 2014. *Qualitative Research Methods Revised Edition*. Bandung: Youth Rosdakarya Offset Bandung
- Nugroho, Riant. 2008. *Public Policy: Policy Theory – Policy Analysis – Process*. Jakarta: Elex Media Komputindo.
- Rahman, Khairul, et al. "DEVELOPMENT OF INDIGENOUS AGENCY CAPACITY IN DEVELOPING STRATEGIC PARTNERSHIP WITH VILLAGE GOVERNMENT." *Systematic Reviews in Pharmacy* 11.11 (2020).
- Rauf, Rahyunir, et al. "Civil Society's Participatory Models: a Policy of Preventing Land and Forest Fire in Indonesia." *International Journal of Innovation, Creativity and Change* 14.3 (2020): 1030-1046.
- Rokan Hilit Regency Regional Regulation Number 19 of 2011 concerning Retribution for Special Parking Places
- Subarsono, A.G. 2009. *Analisis Kebijakan Publik : Konsep, Teori dan Aplikasi*. Yogyakarta : Pustaka Pelajar

- Sugiyono. 2018. *Metode Penelitian Kualitatif : untuk Penelitian yang Bersifat Eksploratif, Enterpretif, Interaktif dan Konstruktif*. Bandung : Alfabeta
- Sujianto, Sujianto. "PARTICIPATORY VILLAGE DEVELOPMENT PLANNING MODEL." *PalArch's Journal of Archaeology of Egypt/Egyptology* 17.5 (2020): 324-336.
- Suparmoko, M., MA, DR. 1987. *State Finance in theory and practice*. Yogyakarta: BPFE
- Syukur, Abdullah. 2000. *Perkembangan Studi Implementasi*. Jakarta : Lembaga Administrasi Negara RI
- Tika, Moh. Pabundu. 2006. *Metode Penelitian Geografi*. Jakarta : Bumi Aksara
- Wahab, Solichin Abdul. 2006. *Analisis Kebijakan dari Formulasi ke Implementasi Kebijakan Negara*. Jakarta : Bumi Aksara
- Winarno, Budi. 2007. *Kebijakan dan Proses Kebijakan Publik*. Yogyakarta : Media Presindo.
- Suryasa, I. W., Rodriguez-Gámez, M., & Koldoris, T. (2021). The COVID-19 pandemic. *International Journal of Health Sciences*, 5(2), vi-ix. <https://doi.org/10.53730/ijhs.v5n2.2937>
- Herman, H., Ardani, I. G. A. I., Aryani, L. N. A., Windiani, I. G. A. T., Adnyana, I. G. N. S., & Setiawati, Y. (2022). Signs and symptoms of depression in children and adolescents with type 1 diabetes mellitus: A case report. *International Journal of Health & Medical Sciences*, 5(1), 150-153. <https://doi.org/10.21744/ijhms.v5n1.1861>