

REVIEWER'S REPORT (1)

Manuscript No.

Manuscript Title

COMPETENCY AND ORGANIZATIONAL CITIZENSHIP BEHAVIOR
IN IMPROVING EMPLOYEE PERFORMANCE OF SHARIA BANK IN
INDONESIA

Authors

Please provide your comments and suggestions considering the following points for 'publication in Journal.

- | | | |
|--|---|--|
| Is the topic of the article suitable for publication? | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes | <input type="checkbox"/> No |
| Is the article original with new and important results? | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes | <input type="checkbox"/> No |
| Is the title of the article appropriate? | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes | <input type="checkbox"/> No |
| Are the abstract and keywords appropriate? | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No |
| Is the quality of the illustrations and tables appropriate? | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No |
| Are the references up-to-date and adequate with journal style? | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes | <input type="checkbox"/> No |
| Is the article well organized and clearly written? | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes | <input type="checkbox"/> No |
| Is the English language satisfactory? | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No |
| Are the conclusions sound and justified? | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No |
| Did the author confuse the summary with conclusion? | <input type="checkbox"/> Yes | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No |

What is your overall grading of the manuscript?

- At least 3 to consider publication after revision 0 1 2 3 4 5
(worst) (best)

COMMENTS:

The paper titled 'Competency and Organizational Citizenship Behavior in Improving Employee Performance of Sharia Bank in Indonesia' explores the relationship between competency, organizational citizenship behavior (OCB), and employee performance in Sharia banks in Indonesia. The study provides valuable insights into the factors that contribute to employee performance in the context of Sharia banking. Overall, the paper presents a well-structured and informative research study. However, there are a few areas that could be improved to enhance the clarity and robustness of the research.

Specific Comments:

Abstract: The abstract provides a brief overview of the study. However, it could be improved by including more specific information about the research methodology, sample size, and key findings. This would help readers better understand the scope and significance of the study.

Introduction: The introduction effectively introduces the topic and highlights the importance of competency and organizational citizenship behavior in enhancing employee performance. However, it would be helpful to provide a clearer research objective and research questions to guide the study. This would provide a stronger foundation for the subsequent sections of the paper.

Methodology: The paper briefly mentions that a survey method was used to collect data from employees in Sharia banks in Indonesia. However, the specific details about the sample size, sampling technique, and data collection instrument are not provided. Including this information would enhance the transparency and replicability of the study.

Results and Discussion: The results and discussion section provides an analysis of the relationship between

competency, organizational citizenship behavior, and employee performance. While the findings are presented and discussed, it would be beneficial to include statistical measures (e.g., correlation coefficients, regression coefficients) to support the reported relationships. Additionally, the discussion could be further expanded by relating the findings to relevant theoretical frameworks or prior empirical studies in the field.

Conclusion: The conclusion effectively summarizes the key findings of the study. However, it would be valuable to include implications and recommendations for practitioners and future research directions. This would provide a more comprehensive and actionable conclusion.

References: The reference list appears to be comprehensive and includes relevant sources. However, there are a few minor formatting issues (e.g., inconsistent capitalization, missing page numbers) that should be corrected to adhere to the required citation style.

Overall, the paper presents an important study on the relationship between competency, organizational citizenship behavior, and employee performance in Sharia banks in Indonesia. With some revisions and additions to address the mentioned areas, the paper has the potential to make a significant contribution to the field of organizational behavior and human resource management in the context of Sharia banking.

RECOMMENDATION REGARDING THIS MANUSCRIPT:

Minor Revisions Major Revisions Reject Another Conference/Journal

REVIEWER'S REPORT (2)

Manuscript No.

Manuscript Title Competency and Organizational Citizenship Behavior in Improving Employee Performance of Sharia Bank in Indonesia

Authors

Please provide your comments and suggestions considering the following points for 'publication in Journal.

- Is the topic of the article suitable for publication? Yes No
- Is the article **original** with **new** and **important** results? Yes No
- Is the title of the article appropriate? Yes No
- Are the abstract and keywords appropriate? Yes No
- Is the quality of the illustrations and tables appropriate? Yes No
- Are the references up-to-date and adequate with journal style? Yes No
- Is the article well organized and clearly written? Yes No
- Is the English language satisfactory? Yes No
- Are the conclusions sound and justified? Yes No
- Did the author confuse the summary with conclusion? Yes No

What is your overall grading of the manuscript?

At least 3 to consider publication after revision 0 1 2 3 4 5
(worst) (best)

COMMENTS:

The paper has some merits to the field. I have some comments for you to improve:

1. The title is acceptable.
2. I have tried to help you rewrite the abstract "**This research aims to address the issue of low performance in**

Islamic banks, particularly in Pekanbaru, Indonesia. The low competency of employees in Islamic banks is identified as one of the key factors contributing to this problem. This lack of competency is attributed to the employees' general educational background, which results in a limited understanding of Sharia rules. Additionally, the low sense of belonging among employees in Islamic banks is believed to further impact the banks' performance, evident in high employee turnover rates. The objective of this study is to investigate the influence of competency on organizational citizenship behavior and employee performance in Islamic banks. The research population consists of 941 workers from Islamic banks in Pekanbaru, with a sample size of 273 individuals selected using the Krejcie-Morgan formula. The data analysis employs SEM-PLS (Structural Equation Modeling-Partial Least Squares). The study's conclusions reveal that competency qualities do not directly or indirectly influence Islamic bank performance. However, the impact of competency on organizational citizenship behavior is found to be minimal. On the other hand, organizational citizenship behavior is identified as a significant factor affecting the performance of personnel in Islamic banks.”


To enhance the quality of this abstract, it would be beneficial to provide more specific details regarding the research methodology, such as the research design, data collection instruments, and statistical analyses conducted. Additionally, it would be valuable to briefly mention the implications of the findings for Islamic banks in Pekanbaru and suggest potential recommendations for improving employee competency and organizational citizenship behavior.

3. In the introduction section, you should summarize the gaps of existing literature, then present you aim to do. Please check carefully.
4. 2. Literature Review could be changed to Literature Review and Hypotheses Development.
5. You have provided quite some details about the research methodology, please check carefully and make sure other people can replicate your method. In addition, this section should be separated into methodology and results, as from page 8 to 10, you are presenting the results.
6. What is the limitation of your study?
7. Other comments include:
Please proofread and correct some of the language errors.
Please check carefully about the subtitles of each section.
Please include some references from JSMS, JLISS, technical gazette and JSISD (www.aasmr.org/sisd)
Format your paper according to the template of the journal.

RECOMMENDATION REGARDING THIS MANUSCRIPT:

Minor Revisions Major Revisions Reject Another Conference/Journal

REVISION TO REVIEWER

 **Zulkifli Rusby** <zulkifli_rusby@fis.uir.ac.id>
kepada Mincong ▾ 20 Jun 2023, 22:16 ☆ ↶ ⋮

Dear Editor,
Here I attached the revision version of our manuscript (1 file) and also the response for the reviewer comments (2 file).
I hope the new version of our manuscript can be accepted and published in the JSMS Journal.
We are waiting for your feedback.

Thank you very much
Regards,
Dr. Zulkifli

3 Lampiran · Dipindai dengan Gmail ⌵

REVIEWER'S REPORT

JSMS RESPONSE...

REVIEWER'S REPORT

JSMS RESPONSE...

Competency and Organizational Citizenship Behavior in Improving Employee Performance of Sharia Bank in Indonesia

JSMS REVISED V...

↶ Balas ↷ Teruskan

RESPONSE (1)

Manuscript No.

Manuscript Title

COMPETENCY AND ORGANIZATIONAL CITIZENSHIP BEHAVIOR
IN IMPROVING EMPLOYEE PERFORMANCE OF SHARIA BANK IN
INDONESIA

Authors

Response :

Abstract has been revised. There already add for some explanation in purpose, methodology, sample size and findings.

Introduction has been revised, some research objective and reseach question has been added.

“From the research background above, it can be formulated the research problems as follows : 1) How was the effect of competency on Islamic bank employees' Organizational Citizenship Behavior (OCB) ?, 2). How was the effect of competency on Islamic bank employees' performance ?, 3). How was the effect of organizational citizenship behavior on Islamic bank employees' performance ?, 4). How was the effect of competency on Islamic bank employees' performance mediates by Organizational Citizenship Behavior (OCB) ?. The purpose of this research was to examine : 1) The effect of competency on Islamic bank employees' Organizational Citizenship Behavior (OCB), 2). The effect of competency on Islamic bank employees' performance, 3). The effect of organizational citizenship behavior on Islamic bank employees' performance. 4). The effect of competency on Islamic bank employees' performance mediates by Organizational Citizenship Behavior (OCB).”

Response : The sample size, sampling technique and data collection method has been revised. "As for the number of samples that can be determined based on the Krejcie-Morgan table formula with an inaccuracy value of 0.05, the sample size obtained is 273 Sharia Bank employees in Pekanbaru, Riau, Indonesia. The sampling technique used is simple random sampling. Simple random sampling is a type of probability sampling in which the researcher randomly selects a subset of participants from a population. A questionnaire with multiple question items is used in this investigation. In this study, the questions used consisted of: 1. Questions about the respondent's profile (Gender, age, status, education, working period). 2. Question about research variables. The questionnaire for this question used 1 to 5 points likert scale. The following research questionnaire have developed from indicator explained on the paper."

Response : The results already presented the statistical result to answer the hypothesis and in the discussion already explained the related findings to the relevant theory of previous research.

Example :

This research is in line with research Martini et al. (2018) and Sabuhari et al. (2020) which state that Competency has significant positive influence on employee performance, but this research is contradictive with research Hajjali et al., (2022) where there is no significant effect between competency on employee performance.

Response : the conclusion has been revised.

This research is also still within the scope of the city of Pekanbaru and it is hoped that the next researchers will be able to extend their research reach to the national and international levels, and also the future research can observed more variables as mediation or moderation such as innovative work behavior, organizational commitment and etc.

Response : the reference has been revised for adding some missing page numbers and format.

RESPONS (2)

Manuscript No.

Manuscript Title

Competency and Organizational Citizenship Behavior in Improving Employee Performance of Sharia Bank in Indonesia

Authors

Response : The abstract is already modified. it also follow some recommendation from reviewer 1.

Response : The research gap and the purpose of this study already stated in the introduction.

Several studies have shown that Competency has a significant positive effect and is very important in improving employee performance (Sabuhari et al., 2020; Swanson et al., 2020; Hajjali et al., 2022), while other studies have shown that Competency has no significant effect on employee performance (Nguyen et al., 2020). Other studies have also found that Competency has a negative effect on employee performance, this negative effect means that if employee Competency is good, then performance will decrease (Mulang 2021).

This is one thing that must be solved through this research, to fill this gap this research uses Organizational Citizenship Behavior. OCB (Organizational Citizenship Behavior) or organizational citizenship behavior is employee behavior carried out voluntarily to improve organizational performance.

Response : Already changed into Literature Review and Hypothesis Development

Response : Some information in methodology has been added. The sampling size, sampling techniques has

explained more detailed. The research instrument has also explained more detail in the likert scale questionnaire, indicator of variables and the question about respondent characteristics. Validity and Reliability test method already mentioned and lastly the SEM method use PLS has been added.

Response : Has been added. The limitations of this study are that this research is only limited to the scope of Islamic banking employees in one city in Indonesia with a limited number of samples, even though the characteristics of Islamic banking employees in one city to another may have differences because Indonesia has various ethnic groups with different cultures. and different individual characteristics.

response :

This manuscript is already proofread

The subtitle of each section already follow the manuscript template

Two references from JSMS has been added

The revision version has follow the manuscript template.

ARTICLE ACCEPTANCE

Journal of System and Management Sciences ISSN: 1816-6075	
JSMS-2023-06-23	Date: July 12, 2023
<u>ACCEPTANCE OF MANUSCRIPT</u>	
Dear	Zulkifli 1, Astri Ayu Purwati 2 , Muhammad Luthfi Hamzah 3 , Muhammad Arif 4 Zulfadli Hamzah 5
I am pleased to inform you that based on the referees reports, your paper entitled	
Competency and Organizational Citizenship Behavior in Improving Employee Performance of Sharia Bank in Indonesia	
has been accepted for the publication in Journal of System and Management Sciences	
The paper will be published in the No.6 issue of 2023.	
With best wishes,	
Yours sincerely	
Mincong Tang (Managing Editor)	